

World Food Programme

A Report from the Office of Evaluation

Thematic Evaluation of WFP's Commitments to Women 1996 – 2001

(2 – 23 March 2002)

CASE STUDY - MALI

by Ms. Paola Franciosi, Team Leader, OEDE Consultant with input from Mr. Traoré Oumou Touré, National Consultant

Rome, June 2002

Ref. OEDE/2002/08/G-e

Acknowledgement

The mission had a short time and a tough task to perform. What has been achieved is mostly due to the collaboration and active participation of WFP staff at the Bamako, Mopti and Timbuktu offices. In spite of their many other assignments, they spent long hours discussing with the mission team, out of their commitment to their role in development and relief operations, and of their wish to better take into account gender issues. WFP counterparts and partners were supportive, and provided constructive suggestions to the mission.

Special thanks go to the following resource persons who have accompanied the mission in one way or the other:

- Fatimata Sow, Gender Focal Point, WFP Bamako
- Coulibaly Zenobou Traoré, Direction nationale de la Promotion de la Femme
- Khadija Bah, WFP Dakar
- Gretchen Bloom, WFP Rome

Acronyms

AP Action Plan

APE Association de Parents d'Eléves ASACO Association de Santé Communautaire

CAFO Coordination des Associations et ONG Féminines du Mali

CDD Country Deputy Director

CO Country Office

COFED Comité Femmes et Développement

CP Country Programme

CPF Commissariat à la Promotion de la Femme

CSCOM Centre de Santé Communautaire CSO Country Strategy Outline

DNPP Direction National de Projets du PAM

DNPF Direction National de la Promotion de la Femme

DRPFEF Direction Régional de la Promotion de la Femme, de l'Enfant

et de la Famille

EWS Early Warning System

FFW Food For Work
FFT Food For Training
GAP Gender Action Plan
GFP Gender Focal Point
GOM Government of Mali
IP Implementing Partner
LOU Letter of Understanding

MAP Management Appraisal Performance MOU Memorandum of Understanding

MPFEF Ministère de la Promotion de la Femme, de l'Enfant et de la Famille

OG Operational Guidelines
ODD Operation Department Dakar

PlanOps Plan of Operation

PRO Protracted Relief Operation

PRODEC Programme Décennal de l'Education et de la Culture PRODESS Programme de Développement Sanitaire et Social PRMC Programme de Restructuration du Marché Céréalier

PRRO Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation RSGA Regional Social and Gender Advisor

QAP Quick Action Project

TBT Timbuktu

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

VAM Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping

Table of Contents

Exec	cunve	Summary	1
1.	Intra	oduction:	1
1.	1.1	Background to the Evaluation of WFP Commitments to Women 1996-2001	
	1.1	Country Case Study Methodology	
	1.2	Country Case Study Methodology	•••
2.	Com	ntry Context	
	2.1	Food Aid Context	
	2.2	Relevance of WFP's Commitments to Women to the Country Context	
	2.3	Gender-Related Inter-Agency Activities	
3.	Oper	rationalization of the Commitments to Women in Mali	3
	3.1	Brief Overview of WFP Assisted Operations	
	3.2	Evolution of the Commitments to Women in Mali	
4.	Mair	nstreaming the Commitments to Women in WFP Assisted	
	Oper	rations in Mali	4
	4.1	Institutional Mechanisms	
	4.2	Programming Process	
	4.3	Resources to Implement the Commitments to Women	9
5.	Rele	vance, Achievements and Impact of the Commitments to Women	9
	5.1	Commitment I	
	5.2	Commitment II	1
	5.3	Commitment III	13
	5.4	Commitment IV	15
	5.5	Commitment V	16
6.	Conc	clusions	1′
υ.	6.1	Relevance	
	6.2	Achievements	
	6.3	Assessment of Impact	
	0.5	Assessment of impact	1
7.	Reco	ommendations for WFP's Enhanced Commitments to Women 2003-2007	20
Ann	exes:		
Ann	ex 1:	WFP's Commitments to Women 1996-2001	
	ex 2:	Key Issues of the Evaluation	
	ex 3:	Country Case Study Methodology	
	ex 4:	Itinerary, List of People Met and Field Visits	
	ex 5:	Summary Overview of WFP Interventions and of the Implementation	
2 XIIII	CA J.	of the Commitments to Women 1996-2001	
Ann	ex 6:	Overview of Gender Training 1996-2001	
	ex 7:	Development of Human Resources in the Mali Country Office	
	ex 8:	FFW/FFT 1996-2001	
	ex 9:	List of Documents Reviewed	

Executive Summary

The Mali case study shows that, overall, the Commitments to Women (CW) appear to be relevant to the national context and are mostly perceived as such by key informants. However, some commitments do not spell out clearly the linkage between the action to be taken and their objective, which makes it difficult to assess their relevance. Information about the CW, and understanding of some CW, are not always strong among counterparts, implementing partners (IPs) and even some WFP staff.

WFP Mali made considerable efforts in order to implement the CW, both at organisational and at operational level. The focus on women's involvement in WFP activities gradually increased. Women were a priority target of the 'social sectors' activities introduced with the Country Programme 1999-2002, health and education. With regard to WFP Mali 'traditional' rural development activities, FFT shows in the last years a constant increase of the percentage of female beneficiaries, an increasing ratio food/person, and since 1999 at least an increase in the quantity of food allocated. Overall, an indication that a clear strategy of investing in women's training is being implemented. With regard to FFW, only partial data were available, but since 1996 in none of the domains considered 'at high density of women' was possible to trace a constant growth either in the percentage of female beneficiaries or in the percentage of food allocated to the domain itself.

The new CSO 2001 shift the major focus of WFP activities from FFW/FFT to the support to social sectors (from 46% to 65% of the CP), where women are again particularly targeted. Two gender/women studies have been carried out during the process of preparation of the two CPs, in 1998 and 2001; an indication of WFP Mali serious effort in implementing the CW. Unfortunately, the studies came up with rather generic conclusions and did not add up many practical inputs to what already identified in the CSOs.

Overall, therefore, increasing attention has been paid to women's participation in WFP activities. However, assessing/measuring the impact, and sometimes even the achievements, of this process is difficult. Monitoring and evaluation are carried out regularly, but the monitoring system is complex and not straight to the point with regard to the implementation of the CW. At project level, gender relevant baseline information is not always available/collected and impact indicators are rarely identified. Post distribution monitoring is not carried out and the only gender disaggregated indicator collected regularly by WFP or IPs is the number of female and male beneficiaries. Some IPs seem to collect regularly gender relevant information within the framework of their own activities, but WFP does not systematically profit from it.

IPs play a key role both in implementation and in monitoring. The level of awareness and motivation with regard to gender issues among IPs seems rather uneven; while some have undergone gender training and apply gender sensitive tools, others apparently hardly see the point of collecting data disaggregated by sex on the number of beneficiaries. PlanOps show over the years increasing attention to issues related to the CW, but project Operational Guidelines for IPs and agreements with IPs do not reflect this element in a systematic and consistent way, so that both information and accountability are weakened.

Attempts of formal collaboration at project level with the government machinery for women were initiated in 1995, but did not bring the expected results; at present regular collaboration

is limited to the support of special events (Women's Day etc.), while at project level contacts and exchanges with the women related Ministry and with women's organisations network is rather uneven.

Staff recruitment has been encouraging female candidates, and female staff has been significantly increased, reaching 100% of national professional officers, 50% of international professional officers and 30% of national general service staff. However, the use of female staff at field level, which could facilitate mobilisation and sensitisation of women's groups, is limited, and not particularly encouraged with IPs.

A GFP was appointed in the CO in 1996, and received regularly some form of gender training. The appointment of a GFP contributed to shift the focus on women's issues in WFP Mali. However, being the GFP the only staff formally accountable for the implementation of the CW, there is a risk of centralising responsibility and knowledge that should be shared by all staff. Only introductory gender training was provided in 1997 to WFP staff and IPs, and apparently did not leave a know-how installed with regard to gender analysis and planning. Two Gender Action Plans (GAP) were prepared in 1996 and in 2001, but reference to CW related issues are found in office workplans only until 1998.

The analysis of Mali case study suggests that for the elaboration and implementation of the new policy WFP should take into account the following elements:

- Ensure a wider consultation process, adopt a simple language, link the CW to clear rationale and objectives and ensure their regular diffusion.
- Adopt a comprehensive strategy for gender training, which should target WFP staff and
 partners including at field level, and be tailored on local projects and context; follow up
 to the training should also be ensured.
- Ensure that the monitoring system include gender relevant indicators (including impact indicators) since the planning stage, adopting structured planning methodologies such as the logical framework.
- Encourage the exchange of information with IPs, relevant governmental services and civil society organisations to get data useful gender sensitive for project identification, monitoring and evaluation.
- Carry out small scale case studies at community level to analyse gender relevant results and impact before, during and after the projects
- Promote sustainable achievements, in particular strengthening women's capacities and their role in decision making, and researching synergies with other development actors to remove practical obstacles to women's/girls' participation, sensitise and train the population concerned, women and men, and involve and strengthen the capacities of local authorities and technical services.
- Ensure that responsibilities for the implementation of the CW are consistently spelled out in relevant documents throughout the project cycle, and adopt gender sensitive tools for evaluating the performance of IPs.
- Ensure that responsibilities for the implementation of the CW are reflected in all relevant WFP staff individual MAPs and job descriptions, and not only in the GFP's.
- Ensure that if a specific Gender Action Plan is prepared, it is elaborated through a participatory process, and incorporated into office workplans.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background to the Evaluation of WFP Commitments to Women 1996-2001 - Overview

WFP has an institutional obligation to evaluate the outcome of the Commitments to Women (see annex 1) and provide an element of accountability to the Executive Board and other stakeholders. This also provides the opportunity to identify lessons learned, and improve on future policy formulation and programming.

The objectives of the overall evaluation of the Commitments to Women therefore include:

- 1. Assess the extent to which the Commitments have been achieved.
- 2. Assess the effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the Commitments.
- 3. Formulate recommendations to help to shape WFP's new Commitments to Gender Equality (CGE) 2003-2007.
- 4. Provide accountability to the Executive Board.

The overall scope of the evaluation includes all policies, activities, mechanisms and programme/project implementation undertaken by WFP during the period 1996-2001. More specifically, the evaluation takes a closer look at how the implementation of the Commitments to Women has affected WFP operations, staff and beneficiaries in five countries. The country case studies in Colombia, Mali, Pakistan, Sri Lanka and Sudan were proposed by field staff during the Consultation Workshop on the Enhanced Commitments to Women 2003-2007 held in Rome in December 2001¹. Annex 2 presents the key issues addressed during the country case studies.

1.2 Country Case Study Methodology

The mission, composed by an international and a national consultant, adopted as much as possible a participatory approach. The motivation and collaboration of WFP staff and their partners, especially in the field, made this process interesting and fruitful (particularly for the evaluation team), and their perceptions and experience were key inputs for the exercise.

During the first week at the Bamako Country Office (CO), group and individual meetings were held with WFP staff, counterparts and partners. The visits to the sub-offices in Timbuktu and Mopti were both opened with a workshop with WFP and DNPP staff to analyse the CW according to their relevance, the related achievements (positive and negative), possible results/impact, main indicators available, facilitating and constraining factors. Together with WFP staff (and with DNPP staff also in Timbuktu), field visits to project sites were then carried out, as well as group and individual meetings with the main implementing partners (IPs) and relevant regional authorities and services. A final debriefing was held in each sub-office with all WFP and DNPP staff, discussing tentative conclusions and recommendations. In the last week, a final debriefing was held at BKO CO with WFP staff in order to review together the main conclusions and recommendations for the actual implementation in Mali of the CW and the future policy. Finally, a debriefing with main WFP partners was held in Bamako to present and discuss the recommendations for the future policy.

The CO Gender Focal Point (GFP) was fully involved in all stage of the exercise. During the field visits to Mopti and Timbuktu, the mission was accompanied by an officer of the Direction National de la Promotion de la Femme (DNPF). The WFP Regional Gender Advisor joined the mission for the first week as a resources person, and came again for the final debriefing in Bamako. The HQ Gender Technical Advisor came in the last days of the mission to present the work in progress for the formulation of the new policy; she also acted as a resource person to the mission.

-

¹ The pertinent WFP Country Offices were approached and accepted the request to volunteer to be among the five case country studies.

Finally, in addition to the tasks set in the Terms of Reference, the mission was asked by the CD to provide whenever possible practical recommendations for WFP Mali. The mission of course did not have the time to go through a comprehensive analysis of all WFP operations in Mali. However, many ideas came during the field visits and the group discussions, and often from WFP staff, counterparts or IPs themselves. These are here presented (in boxes) as simple suggestions to WFP Mali; some of them are the basis for wider recommendations for the elaboration of the new gender policy.

2. COUNTRY CONTEXT

2.1 Food Aid Context

Mali experienced a positive economic growth from 1985 through 1999, particularly pronounced after the devaluation of the FCFA in 1994. However, with a per capita GDP below 300 US\$, Mali still ranks among both the low income and the least developed countries in terms of Human Development; its human development and human poverty index are among the worst in West Africa. The poverty profile for 1998 report 69% of the population living below the poverty line, with a higher incidence of poverty in rural areas (76%)².

The population (about 10.4 million in 2001) is relatively young (49% under 15), and with an annual growth rate of 2.9%, and mostly illiterate (62%). Schooling rates are improving (39% in 1996, 55% in 2000), but are still low and with important gender differentials (60% boys, 43% girls)³. 80% of the population is employed in the agricultural sector. Levels of malnutrition among children under 3 are high (30% in 1996).

Mali has a great agricultural potential, but this is only partially exploited, and a large proportion of the population suffers from food insecurity. Agricultural production is heavily affected by climatic vagaries, and varies depending on the abundance of rainfall and its distribution over time and area, quite apart from the very real dangers of natural disasters to which the country is prone. Rainfall deficits are regular occurrences in Mali, with more frequent dry periods in the north than in the south. With regard to food security, Mali faces two main kinds of problems: a problem of access, as it cannot ensure the necessary quantity of food products at the household level; and a problem of utilisation, as households do not draw the full nutritional potential from the food they consume.

2.2 Relevance of WFP's Commitments to Women to the Country Context

Following the organisation of a National Women's Forum in 1991 and of a national workshop to define a policy for the improvement of women's socio-economic status in 1992, GOM created the Commissariat à la Promotion de la Femme (CPF), which was upgraded in 1997 to the status of Ministry (Ministère de la Promotion de la Femme, de l'Enfant et de la Famille/MPFEF), with decentralised technical services in the regions. At the same time, efforts were done to mainstream gender into some Ministries; this was the case of the Ministère du Développement Rural et de l'Environnement, where in 1996, following a sensitisation programme funded by the Netherland, a gender networks (réseau genre) was established as a consultative body.

With regard to civil society organisations, in 1991 14 women's associations created the Coordination des Associations et ONG Féminines du Mali (CAFO). Today, CAFO groups 597 women's associations and NGOs (306 in Bamako and 291 in Kidal, Koulikoro, Sikasso, Timbuktu, Mopti, Gao and Ségou), with eight regional co-ordinations. CAFO facilitate the dialogue between women's organisations, public bodies and development partners.

Following the Beijing Conference, Mali adopted a Plan of Action 1996-2000 that took up 6 priorities: education (20% increase in girls schooling rate; 20% increase in female literacy rate; improve women's access to vocational training); health (improve women's health status; promote the creation of a socio-

_

² WFP2001c.

³ WFP2001a

cultural environment conducive to the use of reproductive services); environment (further involve women in natural resources management strengthening their decision-making role; support fight against environmental degradation); economic empowerment (reduce poverty, in particular of women; strengthen women's economic role; facilitate women's access to credit; develop female entrepreneurship; relief women's workload especially in rural and peri-urban areas); women's participation to public life and institutional strengthening.

Some of these preoccupations are taken up into national sectoral policies, such as the Programme Décennal de l'Education et de la Culture (PRODEC) 1999-2008, or the Programme de Développement Sanitaire et Social 1999-2007 (PRODESS). In this respect, the objectives and content of WFP Commitments to Women 1996-2001 are directly relevant to the national context of supporting women's development in Mali.

2.3 Gender-Related Inter-Agency Activities

Together with other UN agencies and main bilateral donors, WFP is a member of the Comité Femmes et Développement (COFED). COFED was created in 1990 on the initiative USAid, and its Secretariat is managed by UNDP. At the beginning, COFED was meant to become a formal committee with regular workplans, but in fact at present COFED is more a kind of informal consultative group. COFED meetings are not held regularly, but rather convoked upon request of one or more of its members. COFED has been facilitating its members' support to policy level initiatives, such as the preparation of the Beijing Plan of Action for Mali, or more recently the preparation of studies on the family code and on violence against women. Up to now, COFED does not appear to be dealing with the harmonisation of operational or methodological issues, such as for instance the use of incentives for increasing female attendance to health/education services.

3. OPERATIONALIZATION OF THE COMMITMENTS TO WOMEN BY WFP MALI, 1996-2001

3.1 Brief Overview of WFP Assisted Operations⁴

WFP intervention in Mali dates back to 1968, when the Basic Agreement with the Government of Mali (GOM) was signed. Since that date, 28 projects have been carried out, for a total amount of 200 MiUS\$. Most of these resources (79%) have been allocated to development operations (15 projects for a total amount of 147 MiUS\$), 14% to emergency operations and 7% to protracted relief operations⁵. WFP Mali adopted a decentralised approach, creating several regional sub-offices (Mopti, Gao, Kidal and Timbuku).

The main bulk of experience of WFP Mali has been in FFW and FFT, through a rural development project (2231) that lasted about twenty years (from 1976 to 1997) through four different expansions. The project was based in seven regions and had four components (agricultural production, environmental protection, social infrastructure and training), and provided the basis for the elaboration of the rural development activity operations carried out at present under the CP.

The second long-lasting experience of WFP Mali has been in the field of food security, supporting since its creation in 1981 the Programme de Restructuration du Marché Céréalier (PRMC). This is a joint initiative of GOM and major donors for funding - through a common counterpart fund - measures for accompanying the planned structural reforms (cereal market liberalisation). Through PRMC several structures have been set up: an Early Warning System (EWS), a Market Information System (MIS, now Observatoire du marché agricole), an Office des Produits Agricoles du Mali (OPAM), a National Security Stock (NSS). WFP Mali has been contributing to the PRMC fund in the first years, and since the beginning has been responsible for donors' coordination. The experience has provided the basis for the

-

⁴ See tables in Annex 5.

⁵ WFP2002a

elaboration of the food security activity operations carried out at present under the CP, which consist in further contribution to the PRMC. The implementation of the activity is managed by the Comité d'Orientation et de Coordination du Système de Sécurité Alimentaire (COCSSA), under the Ministry of Finance.

The northern regions of the country - the most vulnerable from a food security perspective -experienced in the early 90s severe civil unrest. WFP Mali was forced to slow down its main development operation and in 1997 launched a PRO to assist the repatriation process of the refugees and the displaced through food aid (colis de rapatriement et de réinstallation) and FFW aimed at rehabilitating social infrastructures. The project was then expanded in a PRRO (5804.01), currently ongoing.

The first CP for Mali (1999-2001) limited the geographical area of intervention to only four regions, built on the previous experiences in rural development and food security, and opened up to two new sectors of intervention: health and education. Four main activities were envisaged: FFW/FFT (38% of the total budget), school canteens (32%), health and nutrition (14%) and food security and early warning system (16%). With regard to health and education, two Quick Action Projects (QAP) were first implemented as pilot exercises prior to the launching of more substantial interventions in those fields, and to make a bridge between the end of rural development 2231.04 and the CP. They were finally part of the CP, due to problems in implementation. Timely evaluations of the pilot exercises allowed important reorientations especially with regard to health interventions.

The 'historical' national counterpart of WFP Mali is the Direction Nationale des Projets du Pam (DNPP), within the Rural Development Ministry (RDWM). However, when opening to the health and education sectors through the CP, WFP Mali has been working directly with the related Ministries. Co-ordination with the new counterparts has been initially difficult and contributed to slow down the implementation of the QAPs; permanent 'WFP focal points' are appointed in the two Ministries. Co-ordination meetings with all WFP counterparts (national and regional level) are carried out twice a year. WFP Mali has a wide range of IPs, including local and international NGOs as well as UN and bilateral agencies. The midterm evaluation of Mali CP recommended to limit reduce their number and ensure consistency in their approaches⁶.

3.2 Evolution of the Commitments to Women in the Mali Country Office

Attention to women/gender issues in WFP Mali pre-dated the introduction of the CW. In 1995, WFP Mali signed an agreement with CPF and DNPP within the framework of FFW/FFT activities (2231.04) for establishing formal collaboration at regional levels. According to an assessment carried out in 1998⁷, however, the implementation of the 1995 WFP/CPF/DNPP agreement was rather limited, due to the lack of knowledge about the agreement at the operational level, and to the turn-over of staff when in 1997 the CPF was upgraded into the present MPFEF. At present, contacts between WFP and MPFEF both at central and regional level appear rather sporadic; no exchange of information or joint project activities are systematically undertaken, at least in Mopti Timbuktu. Since 1998, however, WFP Mali supports the MPFEF in Bamako and in sub-regional office in the organization of events such as the international Women's Day, the Pan African Women's Day and the Rural Women Day.

In 1996, a Gender Focal Point was appointed in the CO, and a first Gender Action Plan (GAP) was prepared. In 1997 gender training was provided for main WFP staff and IPs, and in 1998 a study on the impact of WFP food aid on women was carried out. Office workplans from 1996 to 1998 make explicit reference to CW, focusing on the identification and collaboration with women organizations, the preparation of gender plans of action, increasing the amount of resources allocated for women, provide recommendations for specific projects (2231.00 and 5804.00), and increase WFP female staff and consultants. However, no reference to CW or gender/women related goals are found in office workplans after 1998. A second GAP was prepared for 2000-2001, and a second study on gender issues in WFP areas of intervention was carried out in 2001.

-

⁶ WFP2001b.

⁷ WFP 1998e

4. MAINSTREAMING THE COMMITMENTS TO WOMEN IN WFP ASSISTED OPERATIONS IN MALI

4.1 Institutional Mechanisms

4.1.1 Gender Focal Point (GFP)

In 1996, a female national Project Officer was appointed as the CO GFP. She still acts as GFP, and her job description includes a 15% of her working time assigned to the elaboration and follow up of gender related policies and strategies. Since 1997, every year the GFP underwent some form of gender training. She is based in the Bamako office, and is also in charge of health and food security activities.

4.1.2 Regional Gender Adviser (RGA)

WFP decentralisation resulted in 2001 in the merger of two Clusters--Abidjan and the Sahelian (formally located in Ouagadougou Cluster) into the ODD Bureau. Prior to the integration of the two clusters, there was a gender focal point at the Ouaga Cluster. The current position of Regional Programme Advisor in charge of Gender was initially recruited for one year and attached to the West Africa Coastal Cluster (Abidjan Cluster), with external funding from the United States. She took up the position on November 2000, as Regional Socio-economic/Gender Advisor (RSGA), the original title of the position. Prior to that date, the position was vacant and there was no predecessor. The position served six countries (Benin, Cote d'Ivoire, Ghana, and the three emergency countries-Guinea, Liberia and Sierra Leone). The RSGA position, like other regional positions was relocated from Abidjan to Dakar--the location of the new Bureau; the transfer took effect on 25 October 2001. With the convergence of the two Clusters, the countries served under the position increased from six to12: Burkina Faso, Cape Verde, Cote d'Ivoire, Gambia, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Liberia, Mali, Mauritania, Niger, Senegal and Sierra Leone. The position has never had terms of reference, neither in the Abidjan Cluster nor in Dakar. At recruitment in the Abidjan Cluster, a generic job description was provided to the incumbent. Upon transfer to Dakar, a work plan was developed for the RSGA position. The position has no assistant, and all tasks and issues pertaining to gender are the sole responsibility of the RSGA. The position has no independent budget. The funding available is in the form of a lump sum fund for Gender, VAM and M&E, and is approximately US\$20,000 for the year 2002.

4.1.3 Gender Action Plan (GAP)

A first Action Plan (AP) for Women was prepared by WFP Mali in 1996 (WFP 1996b). The AP included measures to be taken both at CO and project level (at that time, only 2231.04 was ongoing). According to the review of the achievements, a national female Project Officer was recruited, quarterly meetings had been held with DNPP to follow up the implementation of CW, and meetings on this subject were also held with Commisariat à la Promotion Féminine (CPF) et la Coordination des ONGs. At project level, efforts to diffuse information on the CW were done in the regions at different levels (government, partners, women's organisations), and to strengthen the collection of data disaggregated by sex. Following a workshop in Banjul for GFPs, a second Gender Action Plan (GAP) was prepared for 2000-2001, proposing actions for CW 1B, 2 A and B, 3A, B and C, and 4 in some of the projects; the draft was sent for comments to all sub-offices at the end of 1999. Apparently, not many of the actions proposed were implemented up to now, according to the CO due to lack of resources. For field staff, it may be difficult to see the meaning and overall consistency with the projects of scattered recommendations. Annual office workplan integrated CW related issues only until 1998. After that date, no reference to the implementation of the CW is found.

4.1.4 Management and Appraisal of Performance (MAP)

The documents made available to the mission ⁸ do not make any reference to gender/women targets or to the CW, except for the GFP MAP, where specific reference is made to gender issues. In particular, among the GFP tasks are the support to GOM in the preparation of special events (8 March etc.), compilation of gender disaggregated data, and the supervision of specific gender studies. With regard to job descriptions, there is no mention to CW/gender/women related activities for food aid monitors and for the Chargés de Bureau Régional. The job description of the present GFP includes 15% working time for follow up to the implementation of the gender policies and plans of action.

4.1.5 Training

In 1997, a gender training session was held in Mali for WFP staff and IPs as an introduction to basic gender concepts. The GFP attended a training in Dakar in 1998 on integrating gender issues in project planning and implementation, a regional training in 1999 in Cameroon on participatory and gender sensitive monitoring, and a regional training in 2000 in Gambia on gender development. In 2001, the CO Responsible for Programme Unit (Responsible de l'Unité Programme) attended together with a Government counterpart a regional training in Niger on participatory approaches and integration of gender issues in projects.

4.2 Programming Process

4.2.1 Targeting (VAM)

A VAM survey was conducted in Mali early 2001. The present Programme Advisor for ODD reported that in preparation for a VAM survey, she was informed by the ODD VAM officer that while the survey contains pockets of data that are gender sensitive, gender issues were not really a consideration per se. The focus, the objective of VAM surveys, was food security—availability, accessibility and utilization and the identification of key vulnerability issues and the geographical areas associated with such vulnerability.

In fact, even in the last available draft of the VAM document (January 2002) there is little evidence that gender issues were closely looked at. With regard to gender, the analysis comes to some quite obvious conclusions (such as listing among priority beneficiaries, in chronically food insecure and in vulnerable communities, women for education activities, or pregnant and lactating women for health/nutrition activities), but does not appear to take into account the gender division of labour, or gender differentials in the control of assets, for instance, which might be relevant in the identification of coping strategies. A gender perspective should be more closely associated to VAM exercises since their inception, both in the analysis of secondary data and in the elaboration of tools for field surveys (questionnaires, guidelines etc.). Closer collaboration in this sense is already foreseen between ODD VAM officer and the Programme Advisor in charge of gender, according to this last one.

4.2.2 Programming Documents

With the adoption of the CP 1999-2002, WFP Mali reinforced its investment in rural development/FFW/FFT activities (38% of the CP), based on the long lasting experience of 2231.00 and of PRO 5804.00. The CP established to give priority to women's initiatives in specific domains (gardening, reforestation, fixation des dunes and training), so to reach 40% female beneficiaries⁹. The CP also include a food security activity (14% of the CP), through which WFP Mali resumed its contribution

8

⁸ The documents made available to the mission were: 4 MAPs, 2 Plans Individuels de Performance, the Définition d'Emploi of the present GFP, the Fiche de fonction du Chargé du Bureau Régional (Timbuktu), two Description de taches for food aid monitor.

⁹ the previous attempt of reaching 50% female beneficiaries on the PRRO was considered unrealistic by the PRRO final evaluation

to PRMC. Beside, the CP introduced two new activities, health (14% of the CP) and education (32%) which especially targeted women.

The 2001 CSO, following the mid term evaluation of the CP, proposes an increase of the percentage allocated to the education activities (45%), maintaining the focus on girls schooling, and an increase in the percentage allocated to health activities (20%), with special focus on mother and child health. The remaining two activities of the previous CP (rural development and food security) are in the new CSO joint under the activity of crisis prevention and relief (35% of the CP), which will see the contribution to PRMC and FFW/FFT interventions, where women are mentioned only with reference to FFT.

With respect to the previous CP therefore, the 2001 CSO proposes a clear shift to social sectors (from 46 to 65% of the CP) with a focus on women. FFW/FFT activities are reduced and no special measures are foreseen to increase female direct beneficiaries in FFW (as it was in the previous CP); rather, women are confirmed as priority target beneficiaries in FFT.

4.2.3 Plan of Operations

Over the last years, the PlanOps show increasing consideration for issues related to the CW. The Plan of Operations (PlanOps) generally make at least some reference to women in terms of number or percentage of beneficiaries. While these references are minimal in the 1993 PlanOps for Rural Development (FFW/FFT) 2231.04 – where only the training of female beneficiaries is mentioned – the 2000 PlanOps for FFW/FFT 6146.00 includes among its objectives the improvement of women's working opportunities and the support to their activities to meet their strategic needs, and states that priority should be given to women's initiatives. In some cases (health QAP 5942.00, education 6267.00) the PlanOps also encourage women participation in management committees. PlanOps for health QAP 5942 for instance mention that local women group should be associated to the committee managing the activity at CSCOM level. PlanOps for education 6267.00 introduces the requirement of at least one woman in the canteen management committee, which was not considered in the PlanOps of the previous education QAP 5941.00.

Comparison between the PlanOps for the previous education QAP 5941.00 and for the ongoing education 6267.00 also shows increased attention to local cooking and eating habits (flexibility in the choice of cereals considering local habits and time for preparation), and to micro-nutrient deficiencies (the oil is enriched with vitamin A). The implementation of time saving devices/activities for women was foreseen in the QAP, but not implemented as the choice was to concentrate resources on wider coverage of the canteens. Under the new education project, these complementary activities are mentioned as possible initiatives of the IPs, to which WFP could contribute through FFW or FFT.

4.2.4 Memorandum/Letter of Understanding (MOU/LOU)

Overall, LOUs for PRO and PRRO pay more attention to women than MOUs or LOUs for CP projects, but there too it is rarely specified who's is responsible for what in terms of implementation of the CW. For the PRO 5804.00, the LOU with GOM of 1997 set a target for women in FFW/FFT (50% of microprojects recipients). Priority was to be given to activities benefiting women, in particular gardening, reforestation, fixation de dunes, training and alphabetisation. WFP was to promote the creation of women's groups and the collaboration with those already assisted by women's organisations, and the collaboration with the CPF and women's NGOs. Similarly, the LOU of 2000 between GOM and WFP for the PRRO 5804.01 set priority to activities initiated by and benefiting women, especially in agriculture, environment and training; support to women's groups and collaboration with DRMPFEF.

The Agreement signed in 1999 between GOM (Ministry of Water and Rural Development) and WFP for the implementation of the CP (Accord de Programme de Pays) makes explicit reference to targeting women, and in particular with regard to girls schooling, access to health services against malnutrition for vulnerable groups.

MOUs between WFP, DNPP and IPs elaborated in 2000 for Rural Development activities (6146.00) make no reference to the CW or women. MOUs between WFP, the Ministry of Health and the IPs elaborated in 2000 for health activities (5942.00) only list the criteria to identify vulnerable women targeted by the activity. The LOU between WFP, the Ministry of Education and the IPs for education activities (6145.00) only include the number of students in the assisted schools disaggregated by sex.

WFP Mali has elaborated Operational Guidelines (OG) for IPs for health, education and rural development activities. Out of these, only the OG for health (5942.00) made reference to some measure to be taken in line with the CW, indicating that the person in charge of the food stock should be preferably a woman. The OG for education (5941.00 and 6267.00) for instance do not provide indications to IPs about women participation in the Associations des Parents d'Elèves (APE) or in food committees.

Both OG and MOUs with IPs, therefore, fail to fully reflect the increasing attention given over the last years in the PlanOps - through priorities and indications – to CW related issues.

4.2.5 Monitoring & Evaluation

Project monitoring requirements are described in the guidelines for IPs elaborated by WFP Mali for the health, education and rural development activities. For all projects, IPs are requested to submit the number of beneficiaries disaggregated by sex. The presence and role of women in committees is not considered among the monitoring indicators in any of the activities. The capacity/experience of the IPs of working with women and men (IPs' own gender policy, use of female field workers, projects carried out with women's groups etc.) is not systematically taken into account when identifying possible new IPs or evaluating IPs performance. However, among the data provided to the mission for 2001 rural development activities sometimes comments are found on the capacity of IPs to work with women's groups.

Overall, the monitoring system appear complex and not always straight to the point as far as gender issues are concerned. Gender relevant impact indicators are usually not clearly spelled out. Post distribution monitoring is not carried out, and there is no systematic follow up about the utilisation of the assets created through FFW (WFP has a maximum of two field monitors for each region, and their primary concern is project identification and follow up), neither IPs are requested to do so.

With regard to evaluations, project evaluations or assessments have been carried out for the PRO 5804.00, as well as for the health and education QAPs 5941.00 and 5942.00. The final evaluation of the PRO¹⁰ does not pay much attention to women or gender issues, and only remarks that quantitative targets set for women in the project were unrealistic considering the nature of the FFW activities carried out, where women have weak participation. The assessment of education QAP 5941.00 was unable to measure the results or impacts of the project due to lack of data¹¹. Baseline data when existing were not reliable; during the project, data that had not been systematically collected at the schools level, and when collected were not consolidated. However, the mission made some recommendations (such as encouraging the participation of women in the canteen management committees) that were partially taken up in the following education 6267.00. The evaluation of QAP health 5942.00¹² was also unable to assess the results or impact, as the start of the project had been delayed and food distribution had not yet started when the evaluation mission arrived.

WFP Mali has also carried out specific studies to analyse the impact of WFP food aid on women and gender issues in WFP project areas¹³. Unfortunately, these studies were probably over-ambitious; they came in fact to quite generic conclusions and rather few new, clear and operational recommendations.

¹⁰ WFP 1999d

¹¹ WFP 2000p

¹² WFP 2000d

¹³ WFP 1998e and 2001d

The mid term evaluation of the Mali CP carried out in 2001 found that overall the choice of interventions takes into account women¹⁴. The evaluation acknowledges that in FFW and FFT women represent 23% of direct beneficiaries, and are primarily involved in some of the activities (reforestation, gardening, fixation des dunes, training); in terms of quantity of food received, however, men have the biggest share. The evaluation also confirms that gender impact indicators are not taken into account in the present monitoring system, which is unable for instance to consider the advantages women get out of some of the assets created through FFW, or to make the linkage between increased women attendance to health services and improved health status. The evaluation concludes that there is still a weak understanding of gender issues, and that data on gender roles, resources and responsibilities are to be further collected and analysed.

4.3 Resources to Implement the Commitments to Women

The 1997 gender training was funded by the CO, and the 1998 training in Dakar for the GFP by the Gender Action Fund (GAF), which also funded in 1999 training for 200 women on urban sanitation and environmental education. All other trainings (1999, 2000, 2001) were funded by the regional office.

5. RELEVANCE, ACHIEVEMENTS AND IMPACT

- 5.1 Commitment I: Provide Direct Access to Appropriate and Adequate Food
- 1A: Target relief distribution to households, ensuring that women control the family entitlement in 80% of operations handled and subcontracted by WFP
- 1B: Address micro-nutrient deficiencies in certain vulnerable groups of women, children and adolescents; and consider local eating and cooking habits in all operations

5.1.1 Relevance

Commitment 1A is often perceived as unclear by key informants, in particular with regard to the meaning of 'access' and 'control'. Besides, the objective of the CW is not clearly spelled out. One of the hidden assumption behind this CW is probably that direct distribution to women instead that to men is more likely to ensure that all family members get an adequate share of food. This can be the case in some cultural settings, and not in others. The relevance of this commitment should therefore be assessed through post-distribution and nutritional monitoring, but data on this subject are extremely rare.

The commitment was not reported in the one-page synthesis of the CW prepared by the CO and attached to the GAP 2000-2001; an indication that the commitment was not seen as relevant to WFP Mali immediate operations. The PRRO 5804.01 in fact mostly operates through FFW and FFT modalities.

However, relief food distribution is not completely alien to WFP operations in Mali. It was undertaken during the first phase of the PRO 5804.00 either through the distribution of repatriation packages or on an ad hoc basis following specific requests (centers for orphans or handicapped etc.)¹⁵. At present, relief food distribution is made under PRRO 5804.01 when a small scale immediate intervention is required following natural disasters and upon indication of the PRMC EWS¹⁶. On a bigger scale, relief food distribution is undertaken by PRMC, to which also WFP contributes through 6145.00¹⁷.

Key informants perceive as problematic direct relief food distribution to women due to cultural constraints. In fact, even direct distribution to women of their entitlements under normal FFW and FFT modalities had initially been problematic in some areas of the country. People were requested to collect

_

¹⁴ WFP 2001b

¹⁵ WFP1999d

¹⁶ A maximum of 5% per year of the PRRO resources can be used for this purpose, but no more than 2-3% has been necessary up to now.

¹⁷ Relief food distribution has been organised by PRMC approximately every three years; last year about 30 communes benefited from it.

the food at the WFP storehouses in the regional capitals, and women would not travel there from rural areas.

Commitment 1B is generally seen as relevant by key informants. In Mali, chronicle malnutrition (0-3 years) increased from 24% in 1987 to 33% in 1995/6, and 16% of women suffered acute malnutrition¹⁸. The Commitment is in line with the objectives of the GOM 1999-2007 Programme de Développement Sanitaire et Social (PRODESS), as well as with the sectoral priorities set in the Mali Beijing Plan of Action. The importance of considering local eating and cooking habits is also recognised by all key informants.

5.1.2 Achievements

During the first phase of the PRO 5804.00, WFP repatriation packages were distributed by HCR to the heads of the households, therefore mostly to men. At present, relief food distribution in the PRRO 5804.01 is made at village level through community leaders. Distribution at household level is considered logistically not viable due to scattered settlements. Distribution data are disaggregated by sex in terms of beneficiaries, but not in terms of recipients.

Relief food distribution by PRMC targets geographical and administrative areas through EWS; distribution is made at district level, and handled by the local administrative structure (Prefecture) assisted by ad hoc committees.

With regard to the above mentioned difficulties in direct distribution to women of their FFW/FTT entitlements, to overcome the problem initially it was asked to their male relatives to bring a written authorisation of the women to collect their entitlement, but in a mostly illiterate environment this did not made things much easier or transparent. Therefore, now distribution is organised at village level, where women get directly their entitlement.

With regard to commitment 1B, micronutrient deficiencies as such are not specifically addressed in any of the projects. However, all projects provide oil reinforced with vitamin A. In 1999, the CP introduced the health/nutrition and school canteens activities. Health QAP 5942.00 especially targeted vulnerable groups of women and children in order to strengthen their attendance to the Centres de Santé Communautaires (CSCOM) through food incentives, but no specific micro-nutrient support was provided other than the reinforced oil. Attendance rates at the CSCOM in fact increased during the project¹⁹. Education QAP 5941.00 and 6267.00 target children and adolescent through school feeding. The gardening supported through FFW also sometimes provide part of the community contribution to the school canteens, diversifying the diet of the children.

The type of food provided in the food basket has not always been appropriate to local eating and cooking habits. Peas, for instance, required a long time for preparation²⁰. Efforts were made to solve the problem, providing improved peas, and information about their preparation. However, the northern areas were WFP operates are used to an alimentation based on animal proteins, which are at present not included in the food basket.

5.1.3 Assessment of Impact

With regard to commitment 1A, post distribution monitoring is rarely carried out. The only study available to the mission was the one undertaken by the PRMC in 2001²¹. According to the study, female headed households had received the same quantities than male headed households. The role of women in the management of the food aid received by the male heads of households varied according to the cultural setting. In some cases, women who normally manage the harvest did the same with the food aid

¹⁹ WFP 2001b

²⁰ WFP 2001d

¹⁸ UNDP 1998a

²¹ PRMC 2001a

received by the men; in other cases, during the crisis women who are normally associated to food management lost this role, that was taken up by men; in other cases, women that are not normally involved in food management were associated to the management of food aid.

- Post distribution monitoring should be further encouraged in order to better understand local gender relations in the management of food aid
- With regard to commitment 1B., there are no nutritional data available to assess the impact of the activities undertaken.
- The CO could verify the need and possibility of completing food basket with animal proteins and of adopting micro-nutrients supports for vulnerable groups
- 5.2 Commitment II: Take Measures to Ensure Women's Equal Access to and Full Participation in Power Structures and Decision-Making
- 2A: Ensure a lead role for women within all local decision-making committees on food management and in the management of assets created by FFW projects
- 2B: Contribute to UN goal of reaching gender equity by the year 2001, particularly in higher management positions

5.2.1 Relevance

Commitment 2A is consistent with the priorities of the Mali Beijing Plan of Action and with the political commitment of GOM, which brought to an increased number of women in decision-making roles²². It is perceived as relevant by key informants, although some see as difficult its implementation due to cultural factors that in some areas of the country limit women's decision-making role.

Commitment 2B is generally declared relevant by WFP staff, although ownership seems not always strong among male staff about what has been cheerfully named during this mission 'the Kofi Annan's commitment'.

5.2.2 Achievements

The number or role of women in decision making is not taken as an indicator in WFP projects; therefore, it is difficult to measure the achievements in this regard. As we have seen analysing project documents, WFP encourage women participation in the committees in health and education activities, but the statements done at the PlanOPs level are usually not reinforced in the MOU/LOU with IPs or through reporting requirements. This leaves the implementation of the commitment mostly to the motivation and initiative of the different IPs, which apparently have vary different views on this matter.

With regard to relief food distribution (PRMC and PRRO 5804.01), women participation in food distribution committees is generally reported as minimal. The evaluation carried out by PRMC found that in 2001 distribution only 4 out of 140 members of the committees were women. No data were available for the PRRO.

With regard to health activities, women appear to be represented – although as a small minority – in the Associations de Santé Communautaire (ASACO) which are associated at the management of the CSCOM, mainly due to a directive issued in 1999 by the Federation of the ASACO which required having at least two women in the committee. In the implementation of Health 5942.00, WFP had asked to have a woman as manager of the food stock. The ASACO agreed easily, and this was achieved in most of the CSCOM; the only difficulty came where it was impossible to find even one literate woman in the CSCOM area.

_

²² MPFEF 2000a

With regard to education activities, women appear also to be represented as a small minority in the Associations de Parents d'Elèves (APE); there were no data available on the participation of women in the management committees of the school canteens. Women are involved in food management as cooks, and receive food for their work.

With regard to FFW/FFT activities (PRRO 5804.01 and 6146.00), women are involved in decision-making roles where female-only activities are concerned (i.e. female groups doing gardening or reforestation activities, or training etc.). Apart from female gardens, it is rather unclear if and how they are involved in the management of some of the assets created through FFW, such as the wood made available through reforestation, for instance.

As far as commitment 2B is concerned, data show a considerable increase from 1995 to 2001 in the proportion of women among international professional officers (from 33% to 50%) and among the national general service staff (from 15% to 30%); national professional officers are 100% women since 1997. It must be noticed however that project implementation in WFP Mali is decentralised at the regional offices, and there the only female staff is at secretariat level. Recruiting advertisements encourage women candidates and are diffused though several channels, but very few female applications were received when advertising for posts in the regional offices, and the level of the female candidates was not appropriate.

There are indications that women are not always perceived by WFP staff as suitable candidates for 'field' jobs requiring high mobility in difficult settings, but actually there are women who drive motorbikes and work as NGOs 'animatrices' in the field. Female staff in the field could possibly facilitate and motivate women's participation in the different activities, but this appears not to be a major concern or strategy in WFP Mali at the moment, and WFP does not request its IPs to employ female workers.

5.2.3 Assessment of Impact

Due to the general lack of follow up to the implementation of the commitment, it is not possible to assess the impact. However, with regard to commitment 2A few indications come from different sources. According to the PRMC evaluation, the few women who participate in the food distribution committees played an important role in ensuring an equitable distribution, and in particular paid more attention to the needs of the most necessitated. The evaluation recommends to ensure that at least 1/3 of the members of the committees are women. With regard to the women in charge of the food stock in health 5942.00, they appear to have performed acceptably well their role, but their literacy and management capacities need strengthening.

- Women's capacities at grassroots level could be further strengthen through FFT activities, including with regard to management and organisation skills and functional literacy
- The presence and active role of women in decision making could be consistently encouraged/requested in all project documents (PlanOPs, LOU/MOU, Guidelines for IPs), and should be taken as one of the indicators for reporting
- Women involvement in decision making about the use of the assets created through FFW should be further investigated. IPs could be encouraged to provide specific information on this subject
- Encourage IPs to use also female workers. The Mopti regional office has started promoting IPs visits to other IPs project sites, so to develop a common approach and learn form each other's experience. This could be done also with a special focus on women's participation in decision making
- Female NGOs and DRPFEF, when present of the field, could be associated to project identification
 and follow up, in order to provide useful information about local women's groups, support their
 involvement in decision making, and assess the results

- When advertising for a post in the field offices, verify that the channels use are equally accessible to
 women and men. IPs, female NGOs and DRPFEF may be used as additional channels for
 advertising.
- 5.3 Commitment III: Take Positive Action to Facilitate Women's Equal Access to Resources, Employment, Markets and Trade
- 3A. Target 60% of the resources within a CP will be targeted to women and girls in those countries where gender statistics demonstrate a 25% disadvantage for women compared with men
- 3B. Target 50% of education resources within a CP to girls
- 3C. At least 25% of project outputs/assets created with FFW are to be of direct benefit and controlled by women; al least 25% of the generated funds have to be invested in activities aimed at the advancement of women;
- 3D. Use food aid is to be used as a leverage to obtain complementary national and international resources to improve the condition of women.

5.3.1 Relevance

Commitment 3 is consistent with the Mali Beijing Plan of Action; the national education policy of the Programme décennal de Développement de l'Education (PRODEC) 1998-2008 has among its objectives the increase of girls schooling rates from 33% to 70%.

The commitment is generally considered relevant by key informants, although its meaning is not always immediately clear. A certain confusion arise for instance with respect to how resources should be considered for 3A and 3 B, if in terms of monetary value or in terms of quantity of food allocated to women/girls; and in case of 3C, in fact, only the number of female direct beneficiaries was considered in the data provided by the CO. With regard to 3D, at project level some key informants showed perplexity about WFP negotiating power with IPs.

5.3.2 Achievements

According to the data provided by the CO, 30% of the CP resources have been allocated to women/girls, 48% of the resources for education, and direct beneficiaries of FFW/FFT activities are 25% female.

Since 1996 until the adoption of the CP, only relief food distribution and FFW/FFT activities were carried out (2231.00 and PRO 5804.00). Women had a small place in both in terms of direct involvement. PRO 5804.00 was planned to attain 50% female beneficiaries, which its final evaluation found to be an unrealistic target. However, efforts were done since 1997 to increase the number of female direct beneficiaries in FFW/FFT activities, giving priority to female applications in specific domains, such as gardening, following also a 1997 directive from the Ministry of rural development.

The mission tried to trace down these efforts; the Mopti office kindly made an ad hoc research which made available some data at least for the domains considered more 'women-friendly'²³. According to these data, however, since 1996 to 2001 in none of the FFW domains considered it is possible to assess a constant growth either in the percentage of female beneficiaries or in the percentage of food allocated to the domain itself. Beside, the ratio food/person in most of these domains 'at high density of women' tend to decrease. With the data available, it was not possible to compare the situation in other FFW domains where men are more numerous. Data for FFT show instead at least since 1998 a decided and constant increase of the percentage of female beneficiaries, an increasing ratio food/person, and since 1999 at least an increase in the quantity of food allocated. Overall, an indication that a clear strategy of investing in women training is being implemented. The mission found that some of this training appears to be very well received (gardening techniques, food processing etc.); however, the usefulness of some other training (plastic recycling) was not immediately obvious either to the beneficiaries or to the mission itself.

_

²³ See annex 8

With the adoption of the CP, two new activities were introduced, and they both had women/girls as special targets. Education QAP 5941.00 first and then 6267.00, in addition to the school feeding had an incentive component (oil) for girls with at least 80% attendance in grades 1 to 6. The main component of health 5942.00 provided incentives to increase vulnerable women attendance to CSCOM. Both activities appear to have contributed to increase women/girls attendance to the health/education services during project implementation. The 2001 CSO proposes increased allocations to the social domains of health and education (from 46% to 65% of the CP) with a special focus on women, which are also proposed as priority target group for FFT.

There is a trend therefore to increase allocations for women, in particular through increased allocations to social sectors activities, which since their introduction with the first CP had women as a major focus. With regard to rural development FFW/FFT activities, in the last years FFT has been increasingly focusing on women, and getting relatively increasing resources. The mission could not trace such a clear trend as far as FFW is concerned, in spite of the attempt to give priority to women's initiatives stated in the PlanOps.

5.3.3 Assessment of Impact

WFP Mali has clearly made a shift to ensure that women are more involved in its operations. However, there are no available data to assess the impact of the implementation of this commitment. The two studies undertaken on women/gender in 1998 and 2001 come in fact to rather generic conclusions, and more about the potential or the results than the real impact²⁴ of WFP interventions. In fact, there is still little knowledge about the gender dynamics primed by WFP interventions. It is difficult to understand, for instance, how women's and girls' involvement in FFW impact on their workload, and on the time available for schooling/education, or who and how is benefiting from the assets created through FFW.

• Undertake few small scale case studies at community level before, during and after a project in order to better understand the gender dynamics involved

With regard to the incentive approach, both in health and education activities, increased attendance during the incentive period is to be expected, but it doesn't ensure that it would last after incentives are ceased, and in any case its impact depend also on the quality of the services provided. For instance, health 5942.00 may have contributed to raise the attendance rates of vulnerable women and children to the CSCOM, but considering the means available at the CSCOM this is not necessarily linked to improved health care and status. Beside, still there are no data available to assess if attendance rates were maintained after food incentives ceased.

- Health 5942.00 is now over, and the intervention strategy in the sector has changed. However, it could be useful to learn from experience and assess if food incentive has somehow contributed to make women more familiar with the health services. The CO could collect at least the data on attendance rates at the CSCOM on a reasonable time span (before, during and after the project). However, the quality of the health services provided should also be considered when planning similar interventions: health and local authorities should engage themselves to ensure the quality of the services provided.
- The 'incentive' approach for increasing women's/girls' attendance to services should be used only within a clear time framework, and ensuring that appropriate accompanying measures are taken to:
 - remove practical obstacles to women's/girls' attendance (labour and time saving devices)
 - sensitise and train the population concerned, women and men
 - involve and strengthen the capacities of local authorities and technical services

_

²⁴ WFP 1998e, p. 27: "le projet vivres contre travail pose les premiers jalons d'un développement autonome et participatif des femmes..... Malheureusement, les récipiendaires sont peu informées des objectives et des stratégies du PAM »

5.4 Commitment IV:Generate and Disseminate Gender-Disaggregated Data and Information for Planning and Evaluation

All WFP monitoring and reporting will specify:

percentage share of resources received from food distribution by men/women percentage share of benefits by category of activities by man/women; and percentage of positions held by women in the management food distribution

5.4.1 Relevance

This commitment is generally declared as relevant. However, for some key informants it seems not always clear how this is to be implemented, and how data disaggregated by sex could be used other than for reporting purposes.

5.4.2 Achievements

In all activities (other than relief food distribution) the number of recipients is disaggregated by sex since 1996 or 1997. As we have seen analysing commitment 3, however, the relation between number of female/male beneficiaries, activities undertaken and share of resources is not always immediate in the present monitoring system, and it is therefore unlikely to be considered in planning exercises. The number and role of women in decision making committees is not taken as an indicator in any of the projects. Information about the use of the assets created through FFW is not systematically collected, and gender relevant impact indicators are rarely taken into account in project planning.

Data collection is mostly undertaken by IPs, according to the reporting requirements established in MOU/LOU or in the project OP. These usually only take into account the number of female/male beneficiaries. WFP staff report that some IPs are not motivated in the collection of gender disaggregated data. However, in some cases, the mission has found that IPs, within the framework of their own activities, collect quite a lot of useful information that is not known or exploited by WFP. It is for instance the case in TBT of the Programme de Lutte contre l'Ensablement (PLCE), which has about 70 people in the field collecting gender relevant information at village level (such as women and men use of existing infrastructures, literate women and men, existing women and men associations etc.). It is also the case of the Directions Régionales de la Promotion de la Femme, de l'Enfant et de la Famille (DRPFEF) and of the women's NGOs, that can provide useful baseline information about the existing women's groups, which is not systematically exploited by WFP.

5.4.3 Assessment of Impact

More attention has been paid to the collection of data disaggregated by sex, and to the involvement of women in WFP interventions. However, this seems still to be taken more as an exercise limited to detailed quantitative reporting on the number of female/male beneficiaries, rather than a tool for understanding and follow up the gender implications of the interventions undertaken, and for planning ahead.

- Training in gender analysis and planning could be carried out for WFP staff including at regional offices level and key IPs. Training should be of a practical nature, applied to the ongoing and planned WFP interventions, so to clarify their gender implications and the usefulness of gender sensitive monitoring
- The monitoring system could be reviewed to provide simple but significant information for gender sensitive planning such as the trend in the allocation of resources or in women's participation in decision-making
- At project level, simple, realistic but significant indicators, including impact indicators, should be clearly spelled out since the planning stage

• IPs and key local actors should be encouraged to share information among themselves and with WFP on gender issues in project areas

5.5 Commitment V: Improve Accountability on Actions Taken Define the implementation and monitoring requirements of the commitments in the performance of WFP managers and contractual agreements with partners

5.5.1 Relevance

The commitment is generally perceived as relevant by key informants. As the representative of an IP put it: of course it is relevant, otherwise how could WFP ever hope to implement these commitments?

5.5.2 Achievements

As we have seen in chapter 4, programming documents show attention to women involvement in WFP activities, and in some cases even increasing attention (see for instance the comparison of the two PlanOPss for education, par. 4.2.c). However, there is a certain lack of consistency in the different documents for a same project with regard to the implementation of the CW.

For instance, PlanOPss for both health 5942.00 and education 6267.00 mention women participation in the committees, but this is not reflected in the respective MOU/LOU, or OG, and IPs are not requested to report on this subject. The MOU with IPs for health 5942.00 ask for a woman to be in charge of the food stock, but the OG do not ask IPs to report about this. The PlanOPs for rural development 6146.00 set priority to women in FFW and FFT, but this is not mentioned in the MOU with IPs, and in the project OG IPs are only requested to report about the number of female and male beneficiaries. The PlanOPs for education 6267.00 encourage complementary activities from the IPs (including time saving devices/activities for women), but there is no mention about this either in the MOU or in the OG of the project, or in the reporting requirements. Besides, it must be noticed that most of the IPs (and even some WFP staff) had never seen the CW before this mission.

Recently, for FFW/FFT activities some kind of assessment of IPs performance has been introduced, although in not in a systematic manner, a reference to IPs capacity of working with women can also be found. The adoption of an assessment form is now being studied.

With regard to WFP staff, tasks related to CW are included in the GFP job description and MAP. No other MAP or job description made available to the mission made reference to tasks related to CW, and after 1998 no reference to CW target is found in the office workplans, which do not integrate the 2000-2001 GAP. This last one, however, looks more as an output of the regional Banjul workshop for GFPs than the result of a full participatory process at country level.

5.5.3 Assessment of Impact

All IPs are requested to provide data on the number of beneficiaries disaggregated by sex. Apart from that, the lack of consistency about CW related issues in the different project documents (PlanOPs, MOU/LOU, OG) does not contribute to reinforce the message to IPs about WFP CW, or to clarify responsibilities in their implementation. Therefore, IPs approach with regard to gender issues, or to the implementation of the CW, is not harmonized.

- WFP CW should be further diffused, and responsibilities for their implementation should be clearly consistently spelled out in PlanOPs, MOU/LOU and OG
- Assessment of IPs performance should be undertaken systematically, and their motivation/capacity/experience in working with women and men should be included among the criteria of the assessment form or other assessment tools

The GFP is generally well received in her role by other WFP staff, and her inputs have facilitated the achievements of the CO in the implementation of the CW. However, the fact that the she is the only one formally accountable for gender, that she has been GFP for such a long time and always based in the Bamako office, and that gender training was regularly provided only to the GFP, may have lead to a sort of centralisation of responsibility and knowledge, an indication of which may be the only partial attainment of the last GAP targets.

- WFP staff and job descriptions should include staff responsibilities in the implementation of the CW
- If it is considered necessary to have a GAP separate from office workplan, this last should however reflect GAP's main issues
- A GAP may be more effective if developed through a bottom-up approach, discussing with field staff and IPs the whole of each activity/project to come up with shared, consistent and feasible actions to be taken
- Gender training should be more widespread, and target also field staff

CONCLUSIONS

6.1 Relevance

Overall, the CW are consistent with GOM sectoral policies and with the Mali Beijing Plan of Action, and they are mostly perceived as relevant by key informants. However, some commitments do not spell out clearly the linkage between the action to be taken and their objective, such as 1A, which make it difficult to assess their relevance.

Analysing the relevance of the CW with WFP staff and partners, it came out clearly that WFP CW were not very well known. In fact, most of the partners, IPs and even some WFP staff had never seen them written down until this mission came.

It was also evident that some of the CW were not fully understood, and this contributed to their limited diffusion. As a WFP staff reasonably observed, it would be embarrassing to promote and diffuse something you are not even well able to explain to your partners.

6.2 Achievements

WFP Mali has certainly being paying increasing attention to women's involvement in its operations, although not always in a way systematically linked to the CW.

The increase in budget allocations for women appears mainly linked to the introduction - with the first CP in 1999 - of WFP activities in the social sectors (health and education), conceived since the beginning with a special focus on women. Social sectors activities are gaining more and more importance - in budgetary term – with respect to the 'traditional' rural development/FFW/FFT activities, which were the main bulk of WFP operation in the country until 1998, under 2231.04 first and then PRO 5804.00²⁵. With regard to the CW, interventions in the social sectors have been mostly focusing on increasing female attendance to health and education services. Some attempts to address the strengthening of women's role in decision-making have been made, although still in not in a consistent and systematic way.

With regard to rural development/FFW/FFT activities, FFT focused increasingly on women, which are now its priority target. This is a key area for filling in existing gender gaps at different levels, including

²⁵ FFW/FFT activities took more than 80% of the quantity of food distributed under the PRO (WFP 1999d)

those concerning women's participation in public life; there is little evidence that such a powerful tool is now used strategically in a synergic way with other WFP interventions, for instance to strengthening women's capacity to actively participate in decision-making committees involved in WFP interventions.

In FFW, efforts were done to increase the number of direct female beneficiaries, setting target percentages and giving priority to women's initiatives in some of the domains, such as gardening. Keeping the focus on the number of recipients did not bring to a clear shift towards a 'Creating Assets for Rural Women' approach, and in general the assessment of the benefits coming from the creation of assets is not systematically undertaken.

With regard to the implementation of some CW, strong decisions of national bodies were important. It was the case for instance of the involvement of women in the ASACO committees promoted by the ASACO federation, or of the decision of the Ministry of rural Development to give priority to women in gardening activities. However, local technical services at different levels do not seem always prepared and motivated about gender issues.

WFP Mali has been paying increasing attention to issues related to the CW at the planning stage. This is confirmed by the fact that specific studies on women/gender issues were carried out prior to the preparation of the two CPs, and that the PlanOps over the last years tend to include more elements dealing with women's participation in WFP operations. However, this attention is not fully, consistently and explicitly reflected in its agreements with IPs and in the OG for IPs. This, together with the limited circulation of information about the CW, did not contribute to strengthen the implementation and monitoring of the CW at project level, where IPs are key actors.

In fact, detailed information about the CW is at present considerably weak among WFP counterparts, partners and even WFP staff on the field. The initial effort done in 1996 to inform donors and government bodies about the CW – which apparently was not extended to IPs – was not reinforced through regular information measures, such as annexing the CW or making reference to them consistently in all project documents and agreements. Counterparts and IPs were also not requested to regularly trickle down the information about the CW. Staff turn-over and restructuring of government technical services made therefore the initial WFP effort insufficient to ensure proper information about the CW, as they affected the implementation of the WFP/CPF agreement.

Therefore, with regard to gender issues much is left to the initiative of the different IPs. The level of awareness and motivation with regard to gender issues among IPs seems rather uneven; while some have undergone gender training and apply gender sensitive tools, others apparently hardly see the point of collecting data disaggregated by sex on the number of beneficiaries.

Regular collaboration with MPFEF appear at present to be undertaken mostly for the organisation of special events (Women's Day etc.). Efforts were done to liase also at project level with the government machinery for women, although the signature in 1995 of a formal agreement with CPF for rural development 2231.04 apparently did not bring to the expected results. The collaboration with MPFEF and with women's organisations at project level seems at present carried out unevenly; a clearer framework to ensure at least a systematic exchange of information – not necessarily yet under a formal agreement - would benefit both parts.

Monitoring and evaluation are carried out regularly, but the monitoring system is complex and not straight to the point with regard to the implementation of the CW. Post distribution monitoring is not carried out and the only gender disaggregated indicator collected regularly since 1996-1997 by WFP or IPs is the number of female and male beneficiaries. This does not contribute to highlight the gender dynamics primed by WFP interventions. More significant and comprehensive indicators could be developed through the adoption of a structured planning methodology also at project level, as the log-frame methodology which is now being adopted for the preparation of the CP. Some IPs seem to collect regularly gender relevant information within the framework of their own activities, but WFP does not systematically profit from it.

Recruitment of female staff in WFP has been consistently encouraged, doubling over the last five years the percentage of female national general service staff and reaching 100% of female national professional officers. However, the use of female staff at field level, which could facilitate the mobilisation and sensitisation of women's groups, is limited and not explicitly encouraged with IPs.

WFP staff, especially in the field, took active part to the present exercise, showing motivation and creativity which were extremely helpful to the mission. It is not due to lack of willingness or interest on their part if the implementation of the CW at project level is still partial. Rather, the understanding of gender issues, and in particular how to deal with them at project level, is limited. Mali presents a rich variety of local cultures, and women and men have different roles, opportunities and constraints in each of them. There is no 'one-fits-all' solution, and gender stereotypes must be challenged through a better knowledge and understanding of the different cultural settings.

Since the introduction of the CW, a GFP was appointed; there was no turn-over, and the same GFP regularly received training. Gender training for other WFP staff and IPs was carried out only in 1997, and apparently limited to introductory concepts, leaving not much practical know-how on gender issues and the CW installed. Therefore, although the GFP has been consistently promoting the implementation of the CW, there are in fact no fully shared knowledge and skills in this area among both WFP staff and its IPs. GAPs were prepared in 1996 and 2000, but at least the last one does not appear to be the output of a fully participatory exercise, which – in the lack of wider gender training - could have been an opportunity for an organized sharing of knowledge and discussion of problems in the implementation of the CW.

Accountability for the implementation of the CW is not clearly spelled out as far as WFP staff is concerned. MAPs and job descriptions other than the GFP's do not make any reference to CW related issues, and office workplans took up the issue only until 1998. Therefore, the allocation of responsibility for the implementation of the CW rely only on the GAP, and it is not very clear with what strength the GAP will be monitored and its implementation enforced.

6.3 Assessment of Impact

The introduction of the CW lead to a change, increasing the focus on women of WFP interventions. However, as we have seen analysing the single CW, impact, and sometimes achievements, are difficult to assess.

The main problem comes from the lack of a clear definition of impact indicators, as well as from the time span needed for properly assessing the impact of some interventions. Indicators seems now to be mostly focusing on a output/outcome level (such as increase in attendance rates or increase in the number of beneficiaries), rather than on impact level (such as improved health status or sustainable increased income). This has several implications in the planning of the different activities. For instance, assuming as an impact indicator the improved health/educational status would have made immediately clear that providing incentives to increase attendance to health/education services doesn't make much sense if other measures are not implemented at the same time, to ensure quality and sustainability of the service provided.

It must be noticed however that, as the impact is to be defined at the level of overall objective, some CW have exactly the same problem, as they do not spell out clearly their objective, and rather focus on what has to be done (giving food directly to women, allocating a certain percentage of the budget to women, etc.).

Several evaluations have been carried out in the last years on WFP interventions, but their contribution to assessing the impact of the implementation of the CW is limited. The final evaluation of PRO 5804 does not pay much attention to women or gender issues, and only remarks that quantitative targets set for women in the project were unrealistic considering the nature of the FFW activities carried out. The evaluations undertaken on social sectors QAPs did not have the necessary time span to assess their impact, although they contributed to refine and reorient the approach of the interventions. The studies on

women/gender carried out prior to the elaboration of the CPs were ambitious, but their methodology was weak and they came up with rather generic conclusions, without adding up much to what identified in the CSOs, and without providing many practical inputs.

Only the mid term evaluation of the CP provided clear insights with regard to the definition of the intervention logic of the interventions, moving thus the attention from the output/outcome to the impact level. Another interesting insight comes from the assessment carried out by the PRMC in 2001, that highlighted the positive role played by the few women in food decision making committees and the great variability of existing gender dynamics at intra-household in the management of food aid, linked to socio-cultural factors.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR WFP'S ENHANCED COMMITMENTS TO WOMEN 2003-2007

The formulation and implementation of the new policy should take into consideration the following elements.

- 1. CW are not always well known and understood
 - a. Ensure a wider consultation process for the formulation of new CW, paying special attention to include also men in the process.
 - b. Link the CW to clear rationale and objectives
 - c. Formulate the new CW in a direct and simple language and ensure ease of modification to reflect local realities of the intervention area, while still achieving the CW objectives.
 - d. Ensure that the CW are regularly diffused and circulated, including in local languages
- 2. The implementation of the CW need specific capacities in gender analysis, planning and monitoring
 - a. Ensure gender training that goes beyond sensitization to providing tools (such as participatory methods) for effective gender analysis. The training should be:
 - Joint for WFP staff and IPs, including at field level
 - Applied, analysing local projects and identifying concrete actions to be taken
 - b. Ensure follow up to the training, in order to measure its effectiveness and orient the implementation of the skills acquired
- 3. The monitoring system should be reviewed to allow better appreciation of gender relevant impact and changes
 - a. Identify clear and simple gender relevant indicators (including impact indicators to measure impact/change on gender relations at both the household and community levels) from the planning stage, adopting structured planning methodologies such as the logical framework
 - b. Promote post-distribution monitoring to highlight gender dynamics in food management in different socio-cultural settings
 - c. Promote the exchange of significant data and information among IPs and with WFP and encourage the use of gender disaggregated data not only for "reporting" purpose but also as an effective tool for advocacy and policy formulation.
 - d. Associate relevant governmental services and civil society organisations to project identification and monitoring, to improve assessment of women's needs and potentials in different sociocultural settings and follow up to the interventions
 - e. Conduct small scale case studies at community level to analyse gender relevant results and impact before, during and after the project

- f. Encourage the use of female staff at field level also among IPs to facilitate mobilisation and sensitisation of women's groups
- 4. Achievements must be sustainable
 - a. In FFW activities, give priority to activities that may create sustainable assets, ensuring that women are associated to their management and derive substantive benefits/advantages from their creation.
 - b. Support and verify women's participation and role in decision-making committees
 - c. Strengthen through FFT women's capacities, including in organisation and management and functional literacy
 - d. Research synergies with other development actors to:
 - remove practical obstacles to women's/girls' attendance (labour and time saving devices)
 - sensitise and train both men and women of the concerned population
 - involve and strengthen the capacities of local authorities and technical services
- 5. If the CW are relevant and consistent with national policies, their implementation must be a shared responsibility
 - a. Responsibilities for the implementation of the CW should be clearly and consistently spelled out in all:
 - project documents
 - Plans of Operation
 - Operational Guidelines
 - MOU/LOU
 - b. Promote the harmonisation of IPs approaches on gender issues including through exchange of field visits
 - c. Develop and adopt gender sensitive guidelines and tools for assessing the performance of IPs
 - d. Responsibility for the implementation of the CW should be reflected in the MAP and job description of all relevant WFP staff, and not only of the GFP
 - e. Where the need of a separate GAP is felt, this should be however reflected in office workplans
 - f. GAPs are also a shared responsibility, and should be elaborated through a participatory consultative process

Annexes

Annex 1: WFP's Commitments to Women 1996-2001

WFP commits itself to use its resources in interventions that seek to reduce gender-related inequalities through:

Commitment I: Provide direct access to appropriate and adequate food.

- A. Target relief food distributions to households, ensuring that women control the family entitlement in 80 percent of WFP handled and subcontracted operations.
- B. Address micronutrient deficiencies of certain vulnerable groups of women, children and adolescents; and consider local eating and cooking habits in all operations.

Commitment II: Take measures to ensure women's equal access to and full participation in power structures and decision-making.

- A. Ensure a lead role of women within all local decision-making committees on food management and in the management of the assets created by food-for-work projects.
- B. Contribute to the UN goal of reaching gender equity by the year 2001, particularly in higher management positions.

Commitment III: Take positive action to facilitate women's equal access to resources, employment, markets and trade.

- A. Target 60% of country programme resources to women and girls in those countries where gender statistics demonstrate a 25 percentage point disadvantage (gender gap) for women compared with men.
- B. Target 50 % of education resources within a country programme to girls.
- C. At least 25 % of project outputs/ assets created with FFW are to be of direct benefit to and controlled by women; and at least 25 % of generated funds are to be invested in activities aimed at the advancement of women.
- D. Use food aid as a leverage to obtain complementary national and international resources to improve the condition of women.

Commitment IV: Generate and disseminate gender-disaggregated data and information for planning and evaluation.

All WFP Monitoring and Reporting will specify:

- percentage share of resources received from food distribution by men/women;
- percentage share of benefits by category of activities by men/women; and
- percentage of positions held by women in the management of food distribution.

Commitment V: Improve accountability on actions taken. Define the implementation and monitoring requirements of the Commitments in the performance of WFP managers and contractual agreements with partners.

Annex 2: Evaluation Key Issues

The overall evaluation of WFP's Commitments to Women address the following key issues, which are also the basis for the country case study evaluations:

- Are the Commitments to Women relevant?
 - Were the Commitments relevant and realistic when they were introduced in 1996 in terms of:
 - WFP's operating environment; and
 - the overall framework of the UN's gender commitments?
 - > To what degree are they compatible with national plans/policies resulting from Beijing+5?
 - To what degree does the implementation of the Commitments facilitate the pursual of WFP's mandate (feeding the hungry poor)?
 - > To what degree is WFP's interpretation of the Commitments internally compatible and consistent?
- *To what extent have the Commitments to Women been achieved?*
 - ➤ What has hindered/promoted the implementation/obtainment of the Commitments? (address institutional, capacity, political, and socio-cultural factors.)
 - ➤ How effective have corporate guidance and guidelines been in facilitating the implementation of the CWs? Have additional resources been made available? Have these made a difference?
 - What has been the effectiveness of institutional support mechanisms for implementing the CW: e.g. the gender focal point system; the regional and corporate gender advisors? MAPs?
 - ➤ To what extent have the Gender Action Plans (GAP) been an effective tool for implementing the CWs? To what extent are the GAPs integrated/linked to other documentation prepared by the CO? (e.g. project-specific guidelines, training, performance plans MAPs)?
 - > What has been the role of gender advocacy when addressing the Commitments?
 - > If a Commitment is not being achieved, why not?
- What has been the impact on beneficiaries and WFP staff, both intended and unintended, as a result of implementing the Commitments?
 - ➤ How effective have the Commitments been in terms of sustainable outcomes and contributing to people's empowerment in the area of gender?
- To what degree has WFP mainstreamed measures for achieving the Commitments into the relevant policies, operational guidelines, and the mechanisms for implementing these?
 - > To what extent has gender been included effectively in institutional programming mechanisms such as assessment and targeting, vulnerability analysis, project appraisal and formulation, project documents, CSOs, CPs? Plans of Operations? Agreements with implementing partners (IPs)? Memoranda of Understanding with other UN agencies (UNHCR, UNICEF).
 - What type of training on gender has been provided to staff and how effective has it been? To what extent has gender been incorporated into standard corporate training events (e.g. Enabling Development, Management Training, Nutrition Training etc.)
 - ➤ Where relevant/appropriate, are the CWs reflected in the MAPs of WFP staff?

Annex 3: Country Case Study Methodology

Advance Preparations

WFP Country Offices (CO) in the five countries selected for the evaluation received a request for the following advance preparations:

- Tentative itinerary.
- Briefing notes on:
 - The WFP CO organizational chart.
 - Evolution of the Commitments in the CO.
 - Gender specific training activities.
 - ° Gender specific resources.
 - Human resources
- Documentation on programme activities, ongoing and phase out.
- Documentation on institutional mechanisms.
- Relevant documentation on implementing partners and other agencies.
- Selection of the national consultant.

Evaluation Process In-Country

- Document review.
- WFP CO:
 - ° Individual meetings with key WFP programme and support staff.
 - ° Group discussions with all programme and support staff.
- Meetings/Group Discussions:
 - ° Government counterparts.
 - Implementing partners.
 - ° NGOs
 - Donor and other development agencies.
- Fieldwork:
 - Visits to phased-out and ongoing WFP assisted projects and activities (in Balochistan, NWFP and Kashmir) (see Annex 4).
 - ° Meetings with pertinent stakeholders.
 - Interviews and discussions with selected former and current beneficiaries.

Annex 4: Itinerary, List of People Met and Field Visits

Date	Activity	Person Met	Position
2 March	Arrival in Bamako		
3 March	Desk Review		
4 March	Meeting evaluation team/ resource persons	Khadija Bah Fatimata Sow Oumou Traoré	Regional Gender Adviser Project Officer, WFP Mali, GFP National Consultant
	Meeting with WFP staff	Gilbert Cina Jeanne Gouba	Country Director Deputy Country Director
5 March	Meeting with WFP staff and group discussion	Gilbert Cina Jeanne Gouba Pascale Crapouse Racky Fall Fatimata Sow	Country Director Deputy Country Director Programme Officer (FFW/FFT, PRRO) Finance GFP
	Meeting with the Direction nationale de la promotion de la femme (DNPF)	Fatoumata Keita Djenebou Coulibaly Kouniaté Youssouf Aminata Dianara Moussokoro Cissé	Directrice nationale DNPF, promotion économique DNPF, promotion sociale DNPF DNPF
6 March	Meeting with the Direction nationale des Projets du PAM (DNPP) and with WFP focal point for health	Aissata Diallo Amadou Sylla Bandiougon Coulibaly Bakara Thané Kagnassy Dodosy	Directrice nationale DNPP, Div. Suivi-évaluation DNPP DNPP Direction nationale de la Santé
	Meeting with WFP focal point for food security	Oumar Traoré	Secrétaire permanent du Comité d'Orientation et Co-ordination du Système de Sécurité alimentaire (COCSSA/PRMC)
7 March	Meeting with COFED	Giuseppina Mazza Ly Robiaton Traoré Zeina Touré Sissoko Naimouna Touré Assa Sow Doucouré Yacine Diallo	UNDP UNFPA Coopération suisse UNESCO PAREMF UNFPA
	Meeting with USAID	Pamela White Sixte Zigirumugabe Dramane Mariko Gaoussou Traoré Nancy Estes Martire Keita Anna Diallo Rokiatou Diaye Danté Ali Cissé Jo Lesser	Acting Director Health team Food for Peace Food for Peace Infocom Good Governance North Program Education
8 March	Meeting with IPs	Jean-Baptiste Kamaté Mohammed Munier Aboubakar Traoré	World Vision Islamic Relief UK AMPRODE/Sahel

9 March	Travel to Tombouctou		
	Meeting with WFP staff TBT	Tibo Sawadogo Babougou Traoré	Project Officer DNPP
	Meeting with Direction régionale de la Promotion de la Femme, de l'Enfant et de la Famille (DRPFEF)	Koumba Touré Mahamoine Lamine Boulkassoum Cissé Sidi Yehia	Directrice régionale DRPFEF DRPFEF DRPFEF
10 March	• Group session with WFP staff in Tombouctou	Tibo Sawadogo Mohamed Sallah Seydou Cissé Babougou Traoré	Chargé du bureau PAM Tombouctou Food Aid Monitor Food Aid Monitor DNPP
11 March	Meeting with IPs health and education	Mamadoun Dradié Bital Boudiouma Abdul Razac Bocar Touré Mahamane Ousmane Alboukary Touré Mobido Naiga Agaly Maiga	Mairie de Tombouctou Conseiller pédagogique Centre d'animation Vivre sur Terre Académie de l'Enseignement Académie de l'Enseignement Médecin chef, Centre de Santé communautaires Association pour la Promotion du Monde rural au Sahel Association pour le Développement de la Zone aride
	Meeting with women's associations/NGOs and DRPFEF	58 women from about 30 women's grassroots organizations and NGOs	
	Meeting with IPs rural development	Maliamane Djileip Abdul Razac Moussa Diamoye Agaly Maiga Modigo Naiga Aboubakar Traoré	Direction régionale Conservation de la Nature/Programme de Lutte contre l'Ensablement Chambre régionale de l'Agriculture Vivre sur Terre Direction régionale Aménagement et Equipement rural Association pour le Développement de la Zone aride Association pour la Promotion du Monde rural au Sahel Direction régionale Appui au Monde rural
	Visit to project sites, school canteens and "maraîchage"		School Director Association Parents d'Elèves Women's Grassroots Organizations
12 March	• Visit to Goundam-Niafunké, project sites, school canteens, "maraîchage", centre nutritionnels	Bonaventure Traoré	Africare Women's Grassroots Organizations Association Parents d'Elèves School Director
	Debriefing with WFP and DNPP Staff in Tombouctou	Tibo Sawadogo Mohamed Sallah Seydou Cissé Babougou Traoré	Chargé du Bureau du PAM Food Aid Monitor Food Aid Monitor DNPP

13 March	Travel to Mopti		
	Meeting with WFP and DNPP staff	Patrice Kalisa Hamady Diallo Samodi Timbeli Amadou Gi Sidibe Raymond Dembelé Yaruba Dunséié	WFP Co-ordinator In Charge of WFP Office Mopti Food Aid Monitor DNPP Co-ordinator Mopti DNPP DNPP
	Visit to the hospital	Seydou Coulibaly Togola Sidilamine Abouba Mahamane Goly Dia	Director Gynecologist Social Affairs Chief Warden
	Meeting with DRPFEF and women's associations	Sarro Kadidia Sarro Naire Amina Khanta Women Grassroots Organizations	Regional Director DRPFEF CAFO
14 March	 Visit to reforestation project at Siracoro Visit to CSCOM Somadougou 		IP Alliance Mission Women's group Village elders ASACOM female and male members CSCOM staff IP FABA
	Meeting at the Soufouroulaye town hall		Mayor
	Meeting with DRPFEF and CAFO	Sarro Kadidia Sarro Penda Diallo Kampo Haura Thiero Naire Amina Khanta	DRPFEF DRPFEF CAFO CAFO
	Meeting with IPs, FFW and FFT	Mamady Bo Traoré Béni Traoré Asmaou Yattara	Programme spécial de sécurité alimentaire Office du Riz Opération pêche
	Meeting with IPs school canteens	Abdoulaye Diepkilé Amadou Karambé Oumar G. Diali Cissé Salivata Niang	AMPRODE/Sahel Oeuvre malienne d'Aide à l'Enfance Catholic Relief Service Académie d'Education, service de la scolarisation des filles
15 March	Meeting with Centre d'Animation Pédagpgique of Bandiagara		Director Responsible for girls education
	Visit to school canteen at Kokolo and Soroly		School Directors Association Parents d'Elèves Village elders Women's groups IP Christian Service Relief
	Debriefing with WFP and DNPP staff	Patrice Kalisa Hamady Diallo Samodi Timbeli Amadou Gi Sidibe	WFP Co-ordinator In charge of WFP Office Mopti Food Aid Monitor Coordinator DNPP Mopti
16 March	Travel to Bamako by road		
17 March	Meetings with WFP Staff and desk review		

18 March	Meeting with WFP Staff and desk review		
	• Meeting with logframe adviser	Michael Smart	FAO
19 March	 Meeting with WFP Staff Meeting with Headquarters Staff Preparation of Debriefing 	Gretchen Bloom	Gender Adviser
20 March	Debriefing with WFP staff	Gilbert Cina Jeanne Gouba Pascale Crapouse Fatimata Sow Gretchen Bloom	Country Director Deputy Country Director Project Officer Project Officer, GFP HQ Gender Adviser
21 March	• Preparation of general debriefing		
22 March	Debriefing with WFP partners	See List of Participants	
23 March	Departure from the country		

Liste des présences - Atelier de restitution Mission Genre à Muso Kunda, Musée de la Femme Vendredi 22/03/02 à 09h00

Nom et Prénom	Structure / Responsable
1. Gilbert CINA	Représentant du PAM
2. Jeanne Gouba	Responsable Unité des Programmes PAM
3. Fatimata Sow	Chargée de Programme – PAM
4. Arhamatou Diallo	Chargée de Programme – PAM
5. Diallo Aïssata Traoré	Directrice Générale des Projets PAM (MDR)
6. Coulibaly Djénébou Traoré	Direction Nationale Promotion Féminine
7. Moussa Goro	Coordinateur National/Ministère Education
8. Mamy Coulibaly	SAP/MATCL
9. Dramane Mariko	FFP/USAID
10. Alwata Ichata Sahi	SR/Organisation Panafricaine des Femmes
11. Oumar Traoré	SP/COCSSA/PRMC
12. Abdoulaye Kah	Consultant PRMC
13. Ydo Yao	UNESCO
14. Amadou B. Touré	ONG Woïyo-Kondeye
15. Marie Bernadette Traoré/Sissoko	FAO
16. Ba Mariam Kane	Conseillère Coopération Canada
17. Alima Konaté/Sylla	Analyste de Programme PNUD
18. Aboubacar Traoré	Chargé de Projets AMPRODE/SAHEL
19. Adama Berthé	OMS
20. Azarock Ag Inalnchad	Agro Action Allemande
21. Rocksloh Papendieck, Barbara	Programme Mali Nord/GTZ (Coop. Allemande)
22. Yacine M. Diallo	FNUAP
23. Kadija A. Bah	PAM, ODD - Dakar
24. Gretchen Bloom	PAM, Rome
25. Kadidia Sako	Informaticienne PAM
26. Traoré Oumou Touré	Consultante
27. Paola Franciosi	Consultante - PAM, Rome
28. Abdoulaye Ahmadou Maïga	SP/ CAFO Bamako
29. Aminata Fabou Traoré	Programme d'Appui au Renforcement de l'Equité Hommes-Femmes MPFEF/PNUD
30. Sissoko Zeïna	Coopération Suisse
31. Dr Coulibaly Modibo	Direction Nationale de la Santé / Division Nutrition

Annex 5: Summary Overview of WFP Interventions and of the Implementation of the Commitments to Women 1996-2001

1996-2001: Projects by total commitment, duration and number of beneficiaries

Project/Activity	Total Commitment Million US\$	Duration Foreseen*	Beneficiaries	Status
2231.04 Rural Development FFW/FFT	14.3	5 years 6 months	16,450 families	Phased out
5804.00 (Reg. PRO) Food Aid, FFW/FFT	14.0	18 months	Unclear: for Mali 50% women	Phased out
5941.00 (CP/QAP) School Canteens	2.6	1 year	36,300 for school canteens: 15,000 girls for incentives	Phased out
5942.00 (CP/QAP) Health and Nutrition	1.77	1 year	25,484: vulnerable women as specific target groups	Phased out
5804.01 (PRRO) Food Aid, FFW/FFT	4.9	3 years	305,000: out of which 102,000 women	Ongoing
6146.00 (CP) Rural Development (FFW/FFT)	4.6	4 years	93,68: out of which 27,236 women	Ongoing
6145.00 (CP) Food Security	2.4	4 years	Unspecified	Ongoing
6267.00 (CP) School Canteens	7.0	3 years	60,000 students per year; 25,000 girls per year for incentives; 850 female cooks	Ongoing

^{*} According to project summary

Timeline 1996-2001: WFP interventions, main planning and evaluation actions, and CW related actions

Year	Actions	Project*	Activities
1995	o Agreement with CPF	• 2231.04	Rural Dev.: FFW and FFT
1996	o Appointment of GFP	• 2231.04	Rural Dev.: FFW and FFT
	o Gender Action Plan		
1997	o CSO	• 2231.04	Rural Dev.: FFW and FFT
	o Gender training WFP/IPs	• 5804.00 (Reg. PRO)	Food aid, FFW and FFT
1998	Study on impact of WFP food aid on women	• 5804.00 (Reg. PRO)	Food aid, FFW and FFT
	o Gender training GFP		
	o Support to Women's day event		
1999	o CP (1999-2002)	• 5804.00 (Reg. PRO)	Food aid, FFW and FFT
	o Final Evaluation of 5840.00	• 5941.00 (CP/QAP)	School canteens
	o Training GFP: gender sensitive participatory monitoring	• 5942.00 (CO/QAP)	Health and nutrition
	o Support to Women's day event		
2000	o Assessment of 5941.00	• 5804.01 (PRRO)	Food aid, FFW and FFT
	o Assessment of 5942.00	• 5941.00 (CP/QAP)	School canteens
	o Gender Action Plan	• 5942.00 (CP/QAP)	Health and nutrition
	o Gender training GFP	• 6146.00 (CP)	Rural Dev.: FFW and FFT
	o Reply to HQ CW Questionnaire		
	o Support to Women's day event		
2001	o Mid term CP Evaluation	• 5804.01 (PRRO)	Food aid, FFW and FFT
	o CSO	• 5942.00 (CP/QAP)	Health and nutrition
	o Training Resp. of Programme	• 6145.00 (CP)	Food security
	Unit on participatory methods and gender	• 6267.00 (CP)	School canteens
	Gender study on WFP intervention areas	• 6146.00 (CP)	Rural Dev.: FFW and FFT
	Support to Women's day event		

^{*} According to the date the Plan of Operation was signed

Annex 6: Overview of Gender Training 1996-2001

ANNEE	TYPE DE FORMATION	PERSONNES CONCERNEES	FINANCEMENT	OBJECTIF	Bureau d'étude ou formateur	LIEU
1997	Initiation à l'approche genre, concepts de base	 Personnel du bureau du Pam à Bamako, personnel de terrain du Pam, contrepartie nationale, Bamako contrepartie nationale terrain 	Bureau du PAM au Mali	Objectif : initier les participants à l'approche genre, généralités, concepts de base	G force bureau d'étude national	
1998	sur l'analyse du genre :	le point focal :	Rome	Objectif :intégration du genre dans les stades de la préparation et de la mise en œuvre des projets	Consultant international	Dakar
1999	Formation à sur les méthodes participatives pour un suivi qualitatif sensible aux genres,	Point focal	Bureau régional Ouaga	objectif: approche participative pour évaluer les besoin des bénéficiaires de l'aide alimentaire. Après la conception des projets, étudiée à Dakar, comment intégrer le genre dans l'évaluation des projets, quels indicateurs pour une meilleure évaluation;	Consultant international	Garoua Cameroun
1999	Formation des partenaires bénéficiaires des femmes et des jeunes filles en éducation environnementale en assainissement	200 femmes formées à Mopti au recyclage des déchets plastics, métalliques et organiques ;	Bureau régional du PAM à Ouaga	objectif sensibiliser les femmes à l'hygiène et l'assainissement, permettre aux femmes d'entreprendre des activités génératrices de revenus. urbain	par Sema Saniya	
2000	Formation pour le développement du genre dans les actions du PAM au Sahel et en Afrique de l'Ouest	Point focal	Bureau régional	objectif faire un plan d'action intégré des régions du Sahel et de l'Afrique de l'Ouest		Banjul Gambia
2001	Formation aux méthodes participatives	Responsable de l'Unité Programme et Point Focal genre du Gouvernement	Bureau régional	Intégrer l'approche participative dans les projets en faveur des femmes	Consultant international	Niamey Niger

Annex 7: Development of Human Resources in the Mali WFP Country Office

Table 1: Evolution of the WFP CO staffing situation by year and sex

Year (as at Dec 31)	International Professional Officers		Jr. Prof. Officers, Int'l & National UN Volunteers		National Professional Officers		National General Service Staff	
	Male Female		Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
1995	2	1	3	0	1	0	13	2
1996	2	1	3	0	1	1	13	2
1997	3	0	3	0	0	2	13	2
1998	4	1	3	0	0	2	28	5
1999	4	0	3	1	0	3	26	6
2000	2	2	3	1	0	3	27	6
2001	2	2	2	0	0	3	27	8

Table 2: Current Levels of Male/Female National Staff as of January 2002

		Male			Female	
		% of total	% of all		% of total at	% of all
Level	Number	at level	male staff	Number	level	female staff
NOC-Officer	0	0%	0%	0	0%	0%
NOB	0	0%	0%	0	0%	0%
NOA	0	0%	0%	3	100%	27%
Total No.	0			3		
GS -7	1	100%	3.70%	0	0%	0%
GS - 5&6	3	50%	11.11%	3	50%	27%
GS - 3&4	10	71%	37%	4	29%	50%
GS - 1&2	13	93%	48%	1	7%	9%
Total GS	27			8		

Table 3: Current Contract Types of Male/Female National Staff as of January 2002

		Male			Female	
Contract type	No.	% of total in this contract type	% of all male staff	No.	% of total in this contract type	% of all female staff
National Officer	0	0%	0%	3	100%	27%
Appointment of limited duration (short-term professional contract < 4 yrs)	0	0%	0%	0	0	0
General Service	13	81%	48%	3		
National UN Volunteers	0	0%	0%	0	0%	0%
Short-term (Special Service Agreement/SSA, Reimbursable Loan Agreement, Consultant when actually employed)	1	100%	4%	0	0%	0%
Service contracts (protracted SSAs with more benefits)	14	74%	52%	5	26%	45%

Annex 8: FFW/FFT 1996-2001

FFW - ALL PROJECTS ALL REGIONS 1996-2001

Activities with	high women's	narticination							TOT vivres VCT
Activity	Year	Food MT	% of all Food in FFW	Men	Women	Total	% Women	Food/person MT	VCI
Reboisement									
	1996	450,209	7,88	n.a.	n.a.	4389	n.a.	0,103	5713,601
	1997	277,518	3,81	4596	4581	9177	49,92	0,030	7281,111
	1998	312,852	4,70	1043	1943	2986	65,07	0,105	6655,646
	1999	935,861	12,37	8793	4972	13765	36,12	0,068	7563,982
	2000	670,077	11,92	6311	8271	14582	56,72	0,046	5621,956
	2001	828,399	14,34	13319	14406	27725	51,96	0,030	5775,414
Fotal Reboisement	1996-2001	3474,916	9,00	n.a.	n.a.	72624	n.a.	0,048	
Maraichage		,	,					,	
	1996	398,421	6,97	1128	1968	3096	63,57	0,129	
	1997	697,079	9,57	2427	9093	11520	78,93	0,061	
	1998	307,329	4,62	282	2370	2652	89,37	0,116	
	1999	374,329	4,95	1980	5836	7816	74,67	0,048	
	2000	475,886	8,46	2981	8881	11862	74,87	0,040	
	2001	305,955	5,30	2185	7826	10011	78,17	0,031	
Fotal Maraichage	1996-2001	2558,999	6,63	10983	35974	46957	76,61	0,054	
Fixation de							,	,	
lunes									
	1996	0	0,00	0	0	0	0		
	1997	0	0,00	0	0	0	0		
	1998	128,987	1,94	3601	1818	5419	33,55	0,024	
	1999	369,037	4,88	7579	4179	11758	35,54	0,031	
	2000	66,46	1,18	1507	724	2231	32,45	0,030	
	2001	227,665	3,94	7413	2857	10270	27,82	0,022	
Total fixation									
de dunes	1996-2001	792,149	2,05	20100	9578	29678	32,27	0,027	

Centres de formation									
	1996	43,131	0,75	1190	500	1690	29,59	0,026	
	1997	70,392	0,97	1311	175	1486	11,78	0,047	
	1998	20,616	0,31	101	157	258	60,85	0,080	
	1999	147,489	1,95	4148	3873	8021	48,29	0,018	
	2000	91,981	1,64	2155	1976	4131	47,83	0,022	
	2001	29,422	0,51	485	698	1183	59,00	0,025	
Total Centres de formation	1996-2001	403,031	1,04	9390	7379	16769	44,00	0,024	

FFT ALL PROJECTS ALL REGIONS 1996-2001

	Year	Food MT	Men	Women	Total	% Women	Food/person
	1996	87,154	n.a.	n.a.	2080	n.a.	0,042
	1997	100,619	n.a.	n.a.	17754	n.a.	0,006
	1998	118,979	23572	14023	37595	37,30	0,003
	1999	84,051	14542	20178	34720	58,12	0,002
	2000	107,261	2192	3405	5597	60,84	0,019
	2001	282,226	1769	6942	8711	79,69	0,032
TOTAL FFT	1996-2001	780,29	n.a.	n.a.	106457	n.a.	0,007

Annex 9: List of Documents Reviewed

Ministère de la Promotion de la Femme, de l'Enfant et de la Famille/MPFEF 2000

Situation des femmes au Mali cinq ans après la conférence mondiale de Beijing

Ministère de l'Education Nationale

1999

Programme Décennal de l'Education et de la Culture 1999-2008

Ministère de la Santé

1999

° Programme de Développement Sanitaire et Social 1999-2007

UNDP

1998

Plan Cadre des Nations Unies pour l'assistance au développement (UNDAF) 1998-2002

2001

° Etude socio-économique de la région de Tombouctou

United Nations

2001

° Bilan Commun du Pays

Programme de Restructuration du Marché Céréalier/PRMC

2001

Evaluation des opérations de distribution alimentaire gratuite 2001, Rapport final

World Food Programme

1995

 Accord cadre entre la représentation du PAM pour le Mali, la Direction Nationale des Projets PAM au Mali et le Commissariat à la Promotion de la Femme

1996

- Projet de Plan de Travail du Bureau PAM au Mali pour 1996
- ° Plan d'Action en faveur des femmes pour 1996 au Mali : Réalisations

1997

- Schéma de Stratégie de Pays- Mali
- ° Report- Africa Region Gender Meeting: Africa Region Gender Action Plan, Abidjan
- ° MLI 5804.00: Project Summary
- Lettre d'entente entre le Gouvernement de la République du Mali et le PAM pour une assistance alimentaire prolongée en faveur des réfugiés maliens, des populations rapatriées, déplacées internes et affectées par le conflit au Nord du Mali (Projet Régional Mali 5804.00)
- ° Plan de travail du Bureau PAM au Mali pour 1997

1998

- ° Country Programme Mali (1999-2002)
- ° QAP 5942.00: Project Summary
- ° QAP 5941.00: Project Summary
- ° Plan de travail du Bureau PAM au Mali pour 1998
- ° Etude d'impact sur l'aide alimentaire du PAM sur les femmes au Mali

1999

- ° MLI 5804.01 : Project Summary
- Rapport de l'atélier 'Stratégies pour le développement du genre dans les actions du PAM au Sahel et en Afrique de l'Ouest
- ° MLI Q 5941.00 : Guide à l'usage des partnenaires d'exécution
- ° MLI 5804.00 : Rapport résumé de l'évaluation terminale
- ° Accord Programme de Pays entre la république du Mali et le Programme Alimentaire Mondial
- ° Mali, Plan d'action genre 2000-2001

2000

- MLI 5804.00: 2000 Standardised Project Report
- ° MLI 6146.00 : Plan d'Opération
- ° MLI 5804.01 : Lettre d'entente entre le Gouvernement de la République du Mali et le PAM
- ° MLI 5942.00 : Mission de revue technique et d'appreciation de l'activité fondamentale 3 Santé et Nutrition du Programme de Pays du Mali. Conclusions et recommendations.
- ° MLI 6267.00 : Project Summary
- ° MLI 6146.00 : Project Summary
- ° MLI 6145.00: Project Summary
- Protocole d'accord tripartite pour le suivi du volet fréquentation des centres de santé, entre le PAM,
 le Ministère de la Santé, des Personnes agées et de la Solidarité, et l'ONG Consortium le Sahel
- Protocole d'accord tripartite pour le suivi du volet fréquentation des centres de santé, entre le PAM, le Ministère de la Santé, des Personnes agées et de la Solidarité, et l'ONG Groupe de Recherche pour l'amélioration des Initiatives des Populations (GRAIP)
- Protocole d'accord tripartite pour le suivi du volet fréquentation des centres de santé, entre le PAM,
 le Ministère de la Santé, des Personnes agées et de la Solidarité, et l'ONG Faba
- Protocole d'accord tripartite pour le suivi du volet fréquentation des centres de santé, entre le PAM,
 le Ministère de la Santé, des Personnes agées et de la Solidarité, et l'ONG AMPRODE/Sahel
- Protocole d'accord tripartite pour l'assainissement de l'Hopital Régional de Tombouctou entre le PAM, le Ministère de la Santé, des Personnes agées et de la Solidarité, et l'association Nafa Haya (feminine)
- Projet 'Vivres contre travail' (VCT/VCF) MLI 6146.00. Protocole d'entente entre le PAM, la Direction Nationale des Projets du PAM et Action Contre la Faim, partenaire d'exécution
- Projet 'Vivres contre travail' (VCT/VCF) MLI 6146.00. Protocole d'entente entre le PAM, la Direction Nationale des Projets du PAM et Programme Mali Nord, partenaire d'exécution
- ° PAM Mali : Plan de travail 2000

° Mission d'appréciation de l'activité du Programme de Pays Mali « Appui aux cantines scolaires ». Rapport final

2001

- ° Schéma de Stratégie de Pays- Mali
- ° Rapport de l'évaluation à mi-parcours du Programme de Pays-Mali (1998-2002)
- ° Preliminary Vulnerability Analysis- Mali
- ° Etude genre dans les zones d'intérvention du PAM au Mali
- WFP Global Office (CDRom)
- Cettre d'entente annuelle pour l'assistance aux cantines scolaires entre le PAM, le Ministère de l'Education et l'ONG Agro-Action Allemande
- Lettre d'entente annuelle pour l'assistance aux cantines scolaires entre le PAM, le Ministère de l'Education et le partenaire d'exécution GTZ/Programme Mali Nord
- ° Lettre d'entente annuelle pour l'assistance aux cantines scolaires entre le PAM, le Ministère de l'Education et le partenaire d'exécution SEAD
- ° MAP for Project Officers, Administration and Finance officer
- ° Job descriptions for Food Aid Monitors, Chargé de Bureau Régional, and Project Officer
- ° PAM Mali: Plan de travail 2001

2002

Le Programme Alimentaire Mondial au Mali (briefing note by CO Mali)